



Supporting Online Material for

Adding Biofuels to the Invasive Species Fire?

S. Raghu,* R. C. Anderson, C. C. Daehler, A. S. Davis, R. N. Wiedenmann,
D. Simberloff, R. N. Mack

*Author for correspondence. E-mail: raghu@uiuc.edu

Published 22 September 2006, *Science* **313**, 1742 (2006).
DOI: 10.1126/science.1129313

This PDF file includes

Tables S1
References
Bibliography

Table 1. Ideal ecological traits of biomass energy crops (SI) and their relevance to invasive species/ invasiveness.

Traits	Present (P) or contributing (C) to success in invasives	Illustrative references
C ₄ photosynthesis	P, C	(S2–S4)
Long canopy duration	P, C	(S5, S6)
Perennial	P	(S5, S6)
No known pests or diseases	P, C	(S7, S8)
Rapid growth in spring (to out-compete weeds)	P, C	(S5)
Sterile seeds	P	(S9, S10)*
Partitions nutrients to belowground components in the fall	P, C	(S5)
High water-use efficiency	P, C	(S11, S12)

*These references support the view that sterility at the time of release into a new environment is not a guarantee against maintenance of sterility, or against invasiveness.

Table References

- S1. E. A. Heaton, J. H. Clifton-Brown, T. B. Voigt, M. B. Jones, S. P. Long, *Mitigat. Adapt. Strateg. Global Change* **9**, 433 (2004).
- S2. L. Holm, D. L. Plunckett, J. V. Pancho, J. P. Herberger, *The World's Worst Weed: Distribution and Biology* (Univ. of Hawaii Press, Honolulu, Hawaii, 1977), 609 pp.
- S3. M. C. Mack, C. M. D'Antonio, R. E. Ley, *Ecol. Appl.* **11**, 1323 (2001).
- S4. S. J. Milton, *S. Afr. J. Sci.* **100**, 69 (2004).
- S5. C. M. D'Antonio, P. M. Vitousek, *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst.* **23**, 63 (1992).
- S6. C. S. Kolar, D. M. Lodge, *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **16**, 199 (2001).
- S7. S. J. DeWalt, J. S. Denslow, K. Ickes, *Ecology* **85**, 471 (2004).
- S8. R. Keane, M. J. Crawley, *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **17**, 164 (2002).
- S9. A. J. Gray, D. F. Marshall, A. F. Raybouild, *Adv. Ecol. Res* **21**, 1 (1991).
- S10. D. R. Ayres, D. R. Strong, *American Journal of Botany* **88**, 1863 (2001).
- S11. D. C. LeMaitre *et al.*, *For. Ecol. Manage.* **160**, 143 (2002).
- S12. A. H. M. Görgens, B. W. van Wilgen, *S. Afr. J. Sci.* **100**, 27 (2004).

Bibliography of articles consulted in preparing

Adding Biofuels to the Invasive Species Fire?

S. Raghu, R. C. Anderson, C. C. Daehler, A. S. Davis, R. N. Wiedenmann,
D. Simberloff, R. N. Mack

Biology, agronomy and economic benefits of potential biofuel species:

- Clifton-Brown, J. H., and I. Lewandowski. 2000. Overwintering problems of newly established *Miscanthus* populations can be overcome by identifying genotypes with improved rhizome cold tolerance. *New Phytologist* **148**:287–294.
- Greef, J. M., M. Deuter, C. Jung, and J. Schondelmaier. 1997. Genetic diversity of European *Miscanthus* species revealed by AFLP fingerprinting. *Genetic Resources and Crop Evolution* **44**:185–195.
- Heaton, E. A., J. H. Clifton-Brown, T. B. Voigt, M. B. Jones, and S. P. Long. 2004a. *Miscanthus* for renewable energy generation: European Union experience and projections for Illinois. *Mitigation and Adaptation Strategies for Global Change* **9**:433–451.
- Heaton, E. A., T. B. Voigt, and S. P. Long. 2004b. A quantitative review comparing the yields of two candidate C₄ perennial biomass crops in relation to nitrogen, temperature and water. *Biomass and Bioenergy* **27**:21–30.
- Hodgkinson, T. R., M. W. Chase, and S. A. Renvoize. 2001. Genetic resources of *Miscanthus*. *Annals of Applied Biology* **65**:239–248.
- Hodgkinson, T. R., M. W. Chase, C. Takahashi, I. Leitch, M. Bennett, and S. A. Renvoize. 2002. The use of DNA sequencing (*Its* and *Trnl-F*), AFLP and fluorescence *in situ* hybridization to study allopolyploid *Miscanthus* (Poaceae). *American Journal of Botany* **89**:279–286.
- Hodgkinson, T. R., S. A. Renvoize, and M. W. Chase. 1997. Systematics of *Miscanthus*. *Annals of Applied Biology* **49**:189–197.
- Humphreys, M. W., R. S. Yadav, A. J. Cairns, L. B. Turner, J. Humphreys, and L. Skot. 2005. A changing climate for grassland research. *New Phytologist* **169**:9–26.
- Jones, M. B., and M. Walsh, Eds. 2005. *Miscanthus: For Energy and Fibre*. Earthscan Publications, London.
- Lewandowski, I., A. Kicherer, and P. Vonier. 1995. CO₂-balance for the cultivation and combustion of *Miscanthus*. *Biomass and Bioenergy* **8**:81–90.
- Lewandowski, I., and A. Heinz. 2003. Delayed harvest of *Miscanthus* - influences on biomass quantity and quality and environmental impacts of energy production. *European Journal of Agronomy* **19**:45–63.
- Lewandowski, I., J. H. Clifton-Brown, J. M. O. Scurlock, and W. Huisman. 2000. *Miscanthus*: European experience with a novel energy crop. *Biomass and Bioenergy* **19**:209–227.
- Lewandowski, I., J. M. O. Scurlock, E. Lindvall, and M. Christou. 2003. The development and current status of perennial rhizomatous grasses as energy crops in the US and Europe. *Biomass and Bioenergy* **25**:335–361.
- Linde-Laursen, I. 1993. Cytogenetic analysis of *Miscanthus* 'Giganteus', an interspecific hybrid. *Hereditas* **119**:297–300.

- McKendry, P. 2002a. Energy production from biomass (part 1): overview of biomass. *Bioresource Technology* **83**:37–46.
- McKendry, P. 2002b. Energy production from biomass (part 2): conversion technologies. *Bioresource Technology* **83**:47–54.
- McKendry, P. 2002c. Energy production from biomass (part 3): gasification technologies. *Bioresource Technology* **83**:55–63.
- Ormsby, L. 2003. *Miscanthus*: New crop for U.S. farmers? *Agro-Ecology* **12**:6–7.
- Ragauskas, A. J., C. K. Williams, B. H. Davison, G. Britovsek, J. Cairney, C. A. Eckert, W. J. Frederick Jr., J. P. Hallett, D. J. Leak, C. L. Liotta, J. R. Mielenz, R. Murphy, R. Templer, and T. Tschaplinski. 2006. The path forward for biofuels and biomaterials. *Science* **311**:484–489.
- Sage, R. F., and R. K. Monson, Eds. 1999. *C₄ Plant Biology*. Academic Press, San Diego.

Environmental/Ecological risks of C₃ & C₄ grass species:

- Ayres, D. R., and D. R. Strong. 2001. Origin and genetic diversity of *Spartina anglica* (Poaceae) using nuclear DNA markers. *American Journal of Botany* **88**:1863–1867.
- Baer, S. G., S. L. Collins, J. M. Blair, A. K. Knapp, and A. K. Fiedler. 2005. Soil heterogeneity effects on tallgrass prairie community heterogeneity: An application of ecological theory to restoration ecology. *Restoration Ecology* **13**:413–424.
- Bell, G. P. 1997. Ecology and management of *Arundo donax*, and approaches to riparian habitat restoration in Southern California. pages 103–113, in J. H. Brock, P. M. Wade, P. Pysek, and D. Green, Eds. *Plant Invasions: Studies from North America and Europe*. Backhuys Publishers, Leiden, The Netherlands.
- Brown, R. H. 1999. Agronomic Implications of C₄ Photosynthesis. pages 473–508, in R. F. Sage and R. K. Monson, Eds. *C₄ Plant Biology*. Academic Press, San Diego.
- Daehler, C. 1998. The taxonomic distribution of invasive angiosperm plants: ecological insights and comparison to agricultural weeds. *Biological Conservation* **84**:167–180.
- D'Antonio, C. M., and P. M. Vitousek. 1992. Biological invasions by exotic grasses, the grass/fire cycle and global change. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* **23**:63–87.
- Darbyshire, S. J. 2003. *Inventory of Canadian Agricultural Weeds*. Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, Ottawa, Ontario.
- Dudley, T. L. 2000. *Arundo donax*. pages 53–58, in C. C. Bossard, J. M. Randall, and M. C. Hoshovksy, Eds. *Invasive Plants of California's Wilds*. University of California Press, Berkeley.
- Forman, J. 2003. The introduction of American plant species into Europe: issues and consequences. pages 17–39, in L. E. Child, J. H. Brock, G. Brundu, K. Prach, P. Pysek, P. M. Wade, and M. Williamson, Eds. *Plant Invasions: Ecological Threats and Management Solutions*. Backhuys Publishers, Leiden, The Netherlands.
- Gifford, A. L. S., J. B. Ferdy, and J. Molofsky. 2002. Genetic composition and morphological variation among populations of the invasive grass, *Phalaris arundinacea*. *Canadian Journal of Botany* **80**:779–785.
- Gray, A. J., D. F. Marshall, and A. F. Raybould. 1991. A century of evolution in *Spartina anglica*. *Advances in Ecological Research* **21**:1–62.

- Hammond, B. W. 1999. *Saccharum spontaneum* (Gramineae) in Panama: The Physiology and Ecology of Invasion. *Journal of Sustainable Forestry* **8**:23–38.
- Holm, L., D. L. Plunckett, J. V. Pancho, and J. P. Herberger. 1977. The World's Worst Weeds. Distribution and Biology. University of Hawaii Press, Honolulu, Hawaii.
http://plants.usda.gov/cgi_bin/invasive_all.cgi?startChar=M
<http://www.dnr.state.mn.us/invasives/terrestrialplants/grasses/amursilvergrass.html>
- Mack, M. C., C. M. D' Antonio, and R. E. Ley. 2001. Alteration of ecosystem nitrogen dynamics by exotic plants: A case study of C₄ grasses in Hawaii. *Ecological Applications* **11**:1323–1335.
- McWhorter, C. G. 1989. History, biology, and control of johnsongrass. *Reviews of Weed Science* **4**: 85–121.
- McWhorter, C. G. 1993. A 16-yr survey on levels of johnsongrass (*Sorghum halepense*) in Arkansas, Louisiana and Mississippi. *Weed Science* **41**: 669–677.
- Wiedenmann, R. N., and M. K. Solecki. 2003. A contrasting viewpoint about *Miscanthus*. *Agro-Ecology* **12**:10–12.

Invasion ecology & invasive species management:

- D'Antonio, C. M., and P. M. Vitousek. 1992. Biological invasions by exotic grasses, the grass/fire cycle and global change. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* **23**:63–87.
- D'Antonio, C. M., N. E. Jackson, C. C. Horvitz, and R. Hedberg. 2004. Invasive plants in wildland ecosystems: merging the study of invasion processes with management needs. *Frontiers in Ecology and Environment* **2**:513–521.
- DeWalt, S. J., J. S. Denslow, and K. Ickes. 2004. Natural-enemy release facilitates habitat expansion of the invasive tropical shrub *Clidemia hirta*. *Ecology* **85**:471–483.
- Evans, H. C. 1991. Biological control of tropical grassy weeds. pages 52–71, in F. W. G. Baker and P. J. Terry, Eds. *Tropical Grassy Weeds*. CABI, Wallingford, U.K.
- Görgens, A. H. M., and B. W. van Wilgen. 2004. Invasive alien plants and water resources in South Africa: current understanding, predictive ability and research challenges. *South African Journal of Science* **100**:27–33.
- Hackleman, J. C., and W. E. Domingo. 1943. *Hemp, an Illinois war crop*. University of Illinois Agricultural Experiment Station Circular No. 547.
- Hierro, J. L., J. L. Maron, and R. M. Callaway. 2005. A biogeographical approach to plant invasions: the importance of studying exotics in their introduced *and* native range. *Journal of Ecology* **93**:5–15.
- Hobbs, R. J., S. Arico, J. Aronson, J. S. Baron, P. Bridgewater, V. A. Cramer, P. A. Epstein, J. J. Ewel, C. A. Klink, A. E. Lugo, D. Norton, D. Ojima, D. M. Richardson, E. W. Sanderson, F. Valladares, M. Vila, R. Zamora, and M. Zobel. 2006. Novel ecosystems: theoretical and management aspects of the new ecological world order. *Global Ecology and Biogeography* **15**:1–7.
- Holm, L., D. L. Plunckett, J. V. Pancho, and J. P. Herberger. 1977. *The World's Worst Weeds: Distribution and Biology*. University of Hawaii Press, Honolulu, Hawaii.
- Keane, R., and M. J. Crawley. 2002. Exotic plant invasions and the enemy release hypothesis. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution* **17**:164–170.
- Keever, C. 1955. *Heterotheca latifolia*, a new and aggressive exotic dominant in Piedmont Old-Field succession. *Ecology* **36**:732–739.

- Knapp, A. K., and E. Medina. 1999. Success of C₄ Photosynthesis in the Field: Lessons from Communities Dominated by C₄ Plants. pages 251–284, in R. F. Sage and R. K. Monson, Eds. *C₄ Plant Biology*. Academic Press, San Diego.
- Kolar, C. S., and D. M. Lodge. 2001. Progress in invasion biology: predicting invaders. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution* **16**:199–204.
- LeMaitre, D. C., B. W. Van Wilgen, C. M. Gelderblom, C. Bailey, R. A. Champman, and J. A. Nel. 2002. Invasive alien trees and water resources in South Africa: case studies and costs and benefits of management. *Forest Ecology and Management* **160**:143–159.
- LeMaitre, D. C., D. B. Versfeld, and R. A. Champman. 2000. The impact of invading alien plants on surface water resources in South Africa: a preliminary assessment. *Water SA* **26**:397–408.
- Lloret, F., F. Medail, G. Brundu, I. Camarda, E. Moragues, J. Rita, P. Lambdon, and P. E. Hulme. 2005. Species attributes and invasion success by alien plants on Mediterranean islands. *Journal of Ecology* **93**:512–520.
- Macdonald, I. A. W. 2004. Recent research on alien plant invasions and their management in South Africa: a review of the inaugural research symposium of the Working for Water programme. *South African Journal of Science* **100**:21–26.
- Mack, R. N. 1995. Understanding the process of weed invasions: The influence of environmental stochasticity. pages 65–74, in C. Stirton, Ed., *Weeds in a Changing World*. Symposium Proceedings No. 64. British Crop Protection Council, Brighton, U.K.
- Mack, R. N. 1996a. Biotic barriers to plant naturalization. pages 39–46, in *Proceedings of the IX International Symposium on the Biological Control of Weeds*. University of Capetown, Stellenbosch, South Africa.
- Mack, R. N., D. Simberloff, W. M. Lonsdale, H. Evans, M. Clout, and F. A. Bazzaz. 2000. Biotic invasions: Causes, epidemiology, global consequences, and control. *Ecological Applications* **10**:689–710.
- Maron, J. L., and M. Vila. 2001. When do herbivores affect plant invasion? Evidence for the natural enemies and biotic resistance hypotheses. *Oikos* **95**:361–373.
- Milton, S. J. 2004. Grasses as invasive alien plants in South Africa. *South African Journal of Science* **100**:69–74.
- Moody, M. L., and D. H. Les. 2002. Evidence of hybridity in invasive watermilfoil (*Myriophyllum*) populations. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science USA* **99**:14867–14871.
- Myers, J. H., and D. R. Bazely. 2003. *Ecology and control of introduced plants*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, U.K.
- National Research Council. 2002. *Predicting Invasions of Nonindigenous Plants and Plant Pests*. National Academies Press, Washington.
- Randall, J. M., and J. Marinelli, Eds. 1996. *Invasive Plants*. Brooklyn Botanic Garden, Brooklyn, N.Y.
- Richardson, D., P. Pysek, M. Rejmanek, M. G. Barbour, F. D. Panetta, and C. J. West. 2000. Naturalization and invasion of alien plants: concepts and definitions. *Diversity and Distributions* **6**:93–107.
- Simberloff, D. 2003. Confronting introduced species: a form of xenophobia? *Biological Invasions* **5**:179–192.

Risk-benefit analysis of species introductions:

- Anderson, M. C., H. Adams, B. Hope, and M. Powell. 2004. Risk analysis for invasive species: general framework and research needs. *Risk Analysis* **24**:893–900.
- Ewel, J. J., D. J. O'Dowd, J. Bergelson, C. C. Daehler, C. M. D'Antonio, L. D. Gomez, D. R. Gordon, R. J. Hobbs, A. Holt, K. R. Hopper, C. E. Hughes, M. LaHart, R. R. B. Leakey, W. G. Lee, L. L. Loope, D. H. Lorence, S. M. Louda, A. E. Lugo, P. B. McEvoy, D. M. Richardson, and P. M. Vitousek. 1999. Deliberate introductions of species: Research needs. *BioScience* **49**:619–630.
- Groves, R. H., F. D. Panetta, and J. G. Virtue, Eds. 2001. *Weed Risk Assessment*. CSIRO Publishing, Collingwood, Victoria.
- Mack, R. N. 1996b. Predicting the fate and identity of plant invaders: Emergent and emerging approaches. *Biological Conservation* **78**:107–121.
- Pheulong, P. C., P. A. Williams, and S. R. Halloy. 1999. A weed risk assessment model for use as a biosecurity tool evaluating plant introductions. *Journal of Environmental Management* **57**:239–251.
- Pimentel, D., Ed. 2002. *Biological Invasions: Economic and Environmental Costs of Alien Plant, Animal, and Microbe Species*. CRC Press, Boca Raton, Florida.
- Pimentel, D., S. McNair, J. Janecka, J. Wightman, C. Simmonds, C. O'Connell, E. Wong, L. Russel, J. Zern, T. Aquino, and T. Tsomondo. 2001. Economic and environmental threats of alien plant, animal, and microbe invasions. *Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment* **84**:1–20.
- Reichard, S. H., and C. W. Hamilton. 1997. Predicting invasions of woody plants introduced into North America. *Conservation Biology* **11**:193–203.
- Simberloff, D., and M. Alexander. 1998. Assessing risks to ecological systems from biological introductions. pages 147–176, in P. Calow, Ed., *Handbook of Environmental Risk Assessment and Management*. Blackwell Science, London.
- Evans, H. C. 1991. Biological control of tropical grassy weeds. pages 52–71, in F. W. G. Baker and P. J. Terry, Eds. *Tropical Grassy Weeds*. CABI, Wallingford, U.K.
- Goeden, R. D., and L. A. Andres. 1999. Biological control of weeds in terrestrial and aquatic environments. pages 871–890, in T. S. Bellows and T. W. Fisher, Eds. *Handbook of Biological Control: Principles and Applications of Biological Control*. Academic Press, London.

Policy issues:

- Delfosse, E. S. 2005. Risk and ethics in biological control. *Biological Control* **35**:319–329.
- Hilbeck, A., and D. A. Andow. 2004. *Environmental Risk Assessment of Genetically Modified Organisms*. CABI, Wallingford, UK.
- <http://ceq.eh.doe.gov/nepa/regs/eos/eo13112.html> (Executive Order 13112)
- <http://www.gpoaccess.gov/sou/06sou.html> (State of the Union Address, 2006)
- <http://www.whitehouse.gov/energy/> (Renewable Energy Initiative)
- Lodge, D. M., and K. Schrader-Frechette. 2003. Nonindigenous Species: Ecological Explanation, Environmental Ethics, and Public Policy. *Conservation Biology* **17**:31–37.

- Lodge, D. M., S. L. Williams, H. MacIsaac, K. Hayes, B. Leung, S. H. Reichard, R. N. Mack, P. B. Boyle, M. Smith, D. A. Andown, J. T. Carlton, and A. McMichael. 2006. "Biological invasions: Recommendations for U.S. policy and management." Position Paper of the Ecological Society of America.
- Sheppard, A. W., R. Hill, R. A. DeClerck-Floate, A. McClay, T. Olckers, P. C. Quimby, Jr., and H. G. Zimmermann. 2003. A global review of risk-benefit-cost analysis for the introduction of classical biological control agents against weeds: a crisis in the making? *Biocontrol News and Information* **24**:91N–108N.
- Stern, R. 2006. Oil market power and United States national security. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science USA* **103**:1650–1655.
- USDA-APHIS. 2000. *Guidelines for Pathway-Initiated Pest Risk Assessments* v5.02 (October 17, 2000). U.S. Department of Agriculture, Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, Riverdale, MD.

Volume 312 of Science (23 June 2006) presents several alternate perspectives in response to, and challenging, previously featured articles in Science on biofuels/bioenergy development.